

APPLYING THE DESIGN PRINCIPLES TO 3 APPROACHES TO SCHOOL DISCIPLINE:  
A SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISON

		APPROACHES TO SCHOOL DISCIPLINE		
		PUNITIVE	NON-PUNITIVE	
		Exclusionary School Discipline Practices	Restorative Justice Practices	Social and Emotional Learning
<b>DESIGN PRINCIPLES</b>	<b>1. Support responsive relationships for children and adults</b>	<p>Foster feelings of mistrust between students and teachers.<sup>4,29</sup></p> <p>Linked to social isolation of students.<sup>31</sup></p> <p>Linked to negative impacts on parents' views of schools as safe and accepting places.<sup>3</sup></p>	<p>Foster healthy relationships in schools built on a foundation of trust, respect, and care.<sup>62</sup></p> <p>Positively affect student-teacher relationships.<sup>63</sup></p> <p>Increase engagement for students and families and improve two-way communication between the parties involved.<sup>62</sup></p>	<p>Leads to safe classrooms and schools characterized by a supportive culture and climate, positive relationships, deeper learning, improved classroom management, and fewer behavioral problems.<sup>59</sup></p>
	<b>2. Strengthen core life skills</b>	<p>Schools that rely too much on ESD practices forfeit teachable moments that can help students develop skills like self-regulation and self-efficacy.</p>	<p>Aim to create a school climate that develops social and emotional skills and understanding, enhances teaching and learning, and increases social and human capital.<sup>64</sup></p> <p>Replace fear, uncertainty, and punishment as motivators with belonging, connectedness, and a willingness to change.<sup>64</sup></p>	<p>Can foster more empathy and prosocial behaviors; enhanced self-efficacy and confidence; greater attachment, commitment, and engagement in school; and improved academic performance.<sup>65</sup></p> <p>Self-regulation, self-efficacy, and empathy skills are linked to one's ability to cultivate resilience.<sup>26</sup></p>
	<b>3. Reduce sources of stress in the lives of children and families</b>	<p>Produce stressful and negative experiences for children and families (especially at the preschool level).<sup>23</sup></p> <p>May retrigger histories of trauma for children if someone in their household has been or is incarcerated.<sup>66</sup></p>	<p>Can reduce the suspension rate across a school district.<sup>50</sup></p> <p>Contribute to narrowing the racial discipline gap for Black non-Hispanic and Hispanic students.<sup>50</sup></p> <p>Test scores steadily improved during implementation.<sup>50</sup></p>	<p>Can help reduce negative risk taking and emotional distress.<sup>65</sup></p> <p>School discipline policies grounded in core principles of SEL have been shown to shift race and gender disparities.<sup>59</sup></p>