## First Regular Session Seventy-third General Assembly STATE OF COLORADO

### REREVISED

3rd Reading Unamended June 7, 2021

Amended 2nd Reading

Reading Unamended

3rd

Amended 2nd Reading

SENATE

May 12, 2021

SENATE

May 13, 2021

HOUSE

June 3, 2021

HOUSE

This Version Includes All Amendments Adopted in the Second House SENATE BILL 21-169

LLS NO. 21-0594.01 Richard Sweetman x4333

#### SENATE SPONSORSHIP

Buckner, Fields, Moreno, Story

### **HOUSE SPONSORSHIP**

**Ricks and Esgar,** Amabile, Bernett, Boesenecker, Caraveo, Cutter, Duran, Exum, Gonzales-Gutierrez, Herod, Hooton, Jackson, Jodeh, Kennedy, Kipp, Lontine, Snyder, Valdez A., Weissman, Woodrow

Senate Committees Business, Labor, & Technology House Committees Health & Insurance

# A BILL FOR AN ACT

## 101 CONCERNING PROTECTING CONSUMERS FROM UNFAIR

102 **DISCRIMINATION IN INSURANCE PRACTICES.** 

#### **Bill Summary**

(Note: This summary applies to this bill as introduced and does not reflect any amendments that may be subsequently adopted. If this bill passes third reading in the house of introduction, a bill summary that applies to the reengrossed version of this bill will be available at <u>http://leg.colorado.gov.</u>)

An insurer is prohibited from:

- Considering an individual's race, color, national or ethnic origin, religion, sex, sexual orientation, disability, or transgender status in any insurance practice; or
- Directly or indirectly using any external consumer data and information source, algorithm, or predictive model

(external data source) that unfairly discriminates against an individual based on an individual's race, color, national or ethnic origin, religion, sex, sexual orientation, disability, or transgender status.

On and after January 1, 2022, an insurer that uses one or more external data sources in any insurance practice shall submit certain disclosures to the division of insurance. The commissioner of insurance (commissioner) may examine and investigate an insurer's use of an external data source. If the commissioner determines that use of an external data source bears no direct causal relationship to insurance losses or to the condition of a property or applicant to be potentially insured and that the use of the external data source unfairly discriminates on the basis of an individual's membership in a protected class, the commissioner may promulgate rules restricting or prohibiting the use of the external data source.

1 Be it enacted by the General Assembly of the State of Colorado:

2

3

**SECTION 1. Legislative declaration.** (1) The general assembly finds that:

4 (a) Increasingly, insurers use external consumer data and
5 information sources, as well as algorithms and predictive models using
6 external consumer data and information sources, in their insurance rating,
7 underwriting, claims, and other business practices;

8 (b) Although such tools have the potential to benefit insurers and 9 consumers by simplifying and expediting insurance rating, underwriting, 10 and claims processes, the accuracy and reliability of external consumer 11 data and information sources can vary greatly, and some algorithms and 12 predictive models may lack a sufficient rationale for use in insurance 13 practices; and

(c) The use of particular external consumer data and information
sources, as well as algorithms and predictive models using external
consumer data and information sources, by insurers may have a
significant negative impact not only on the availability and affordability

of insurance for protected classes of consumers, but also on the utilization
 of such insurance.

3 (2) The general assembly therefore declares that in order to ensure
4 that all Colorado residents have fair and equitable access to insurance
5 products, it is necessary to:

6

(a) Prohibit:

7 (I) Unfair discrimination based on race, color, national or ethnic
8 origin, religion, sex, sexual orientation, disability, gender identity, or
9 gender expression in any insurance practice; and

(II) The use of external consumer data and information sources,
as well as algorithms and predictive models using external consumer data
and information sources, which use has the result of unfairly
discriminating based on race, color, national or ethnic origin, religion,
sex, sexual orientation, disability, gender identity, or gender expression;
and

16 (b) After notice and rule-making by the commissioner of 17 insurance, require insurers that use external consumer data and 18 information sources, algorithms, and predictive models to control for, or 19 otherwise demonstrate that such use does not result in, unfair 20 discrimination.

SECTION 2. In Colorado Revised Statutes, add 10-3-1104.9 as
follows:

10-3-1104.9. Insurers' use of external consumer data and
 information sources, algorithms, and predictive models - unfair
 discrimination prohibited - rules - stakeholder process required investigations - definitions - repeal. (1) IN ADDITION TO THE METHODS
 AND PRACTICES PROHIBITED PURSUANT TO SECTION 10-3-1104 (1)(f), AN

1 INSURER SHALL NOT, WITH REGARD TO ANY INSURANCE PRACTICE:

2 (a) UNFAIRLY DISCRIMINATE BASED ON RACE, COLOR, NATIONAL
3 OR ETHNIC ORIGIN, RELIGION, SEX, SEXUAL ORIENTATION, DISABILITY,
4 GENDER IDENTITY, OR GENDER EXPRESSION; OR

5 (b) PURSUANT TO RULES ADOPTED BY THE COMMISSIONER, USE 6 ANY EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES, AS WELL 7 AS ANY ALGORITHMS OR PREDICTIVE MODELS THAT USE EXTERNAL 8 CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES, IN A WAY THAT UNFAIRLY 9 DISCRIMINATES BASED ON RACE, COLOR, NATIONAL OR ETHNIC ORIGIN, 10 RELIGION, SEX, SEXUAL ORIENTATION, DISABILITY, GENDER IDENTITY, OR 11 GENDER EXPRESSION.

12 (2) (a) THE COMMISSIONER SHALL ADOPT RULES FOR THE13 IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS SECTION.

14 (b) THE COMMISSIONER SHALL ENGAGE IN A STAKEHOLDER 15 PROCESS PRIOR TO THE ADOPTION OF RULES FOR ANY TYPE OF INSURANCE 16 THAT INCLUDES CARRIERS, PRODUCERS, CONSUMER REPRESENTATIVES, 17 AND OTHER INTERESTED PARTIES. THE COMMISSIONER SHALL HOLD 18 STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS FOR STAKEHOLDERS OF DIFFERENT TYPES OF 19 INSURANCE TO ENSURE SUFFICIENT OPPORTUNITY TO CONSIDER FACTORS 20 AND PROCESSES RELEVANT TO EACH TYPE OF INSURANCE. THE 21 COMMISSIONER SHALL PROVIDE NOTICE OF STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS ON 22 THE DIVISION WEBSITE, AND STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS SHALL BE OPEN TO 23 THE PUBLIC.

(3) (a) AFTER THE STAKEHOLDER PROCESS DESCRIBED IN
SUBSECTION (2) OF THIS SECTION, THE COMMISSIONER SHALL ADOPT RULES
FOR SPECIFIC TYPES OF INSURANCE, BY INSURANCE PRACTICE, WHICH
RULES ESTABLISH MEANS BY WHICH AN INSURER MAY DEMONSTRATE, TO

-4-

1 THE EXTENT PRACTICABLE, THAT IT HAS TESTED WHETHER ITS USE OF 2 EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES, AS WELL AS 3 ALGORITHMS OR PREDICTIVE MODELS USING EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA 4 AND INFORMATION SOURCES, UNFAIRLY DISCRIMINATES BASED ON RACE, 5 COLOR, NATIONAL OR ETHNIC ORIGIN, RELIGION, SEX, SEXUAL 6 ORIENTATION, DISABILITY, GENDER IDENTITY, OR GENDER EXPRESSION. 7 THE RULES SHALL NOT BECOME EFFECTIVE UNTIL JANUARY 1, 2023, AT 8 THE EARLIEST, FOR ANY TYPE OF INSURANCE, AND THE COMMISSIONER 9 SHALL CONSIDER SOLVENCY IMPACTS, IF ANY, TO INSURERS IN ADOPTING 10 THE RULES. 11 (b) RULES ADOPTED PURSUANT TO THIS SECTION MUST REQUIRE 12 EACH INSURER TO: 13 (I) PROVIDE INFORMATION TO THE COMMISSIONER CONCERNING 14 THE EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES USED BY 15 THE INSURER IN THE DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF 16 ALGORITHMS AND PREDICTIVE MODELS FOR A PARTICULAR TYPE OF 17 INSURANCE AND INSURANCE PRACTICE; 18 (II) PROVIDE AN EXPLANATION OF THE MANNER IN WHICH THE 19 INSURER USES EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES, 20 AS WELL AS ALGORITHMS AND PREDICTIVE MODELS USING EXTERNAL 21 CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES, FOR THE PARTICULAR TYPE 22 OF INSURANCE AND INSURANCE PRACTICE; 23 (III) ESTABLISH AND MAINTAIN A RISK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK 24 OR SIMILAR PROCESSES OR PROCEDURES THAT ARE REASONABLY DESIGNED 25 TO DETERMINE, TO THE EXTENT PRACTICABLE, WHETHER THE INSURER'S 26 USE OF EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES, AS WELL 27 AS ALGORITHMS AND PREDICTIVE MODELS USING EXTERNAL CONSUMER

1	DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES, UNFAIRLY DISCRIMINATES BASED ON
2	RACE, COLOR, NATIONAL OR ETHNIC ORIGIN, RELIGION, SEX, SEXUAL
3	ORIENTATION, DISABILITY, GENDER IDENTITY, OR GENDER EXPRESSION;
4	(IV) PROVIDE AN ASSESSMENT OF THE RESULTS OF THE RISK
5	MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK OR SIMILAR PROCESSES OR PROCEDURES AND
6	ACTIONS TAKEN TO MINIMIZE THE RISK OF UNFAIR DISCRIMINATION,
7	INCLUDING ONGOING MONITORING; AND
8	(V) PROVIDE AN ATTESTATION BY ONE OR MORE OFFICERS THAT
9	THE INSURER HAS IMPLEMENTED THE RISK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK OR
10	SIMILAR PROCESSES OR PROCEDURES APPROPRIATELY ON A CONTINUOUS
11	BASIS.
12	(c) The rules adopted by the commissioner pursuant to this
13	SECTION MUST INCLUDE PROVISIONS ESTABLISHING:
14	(I) A REASONABLE PERIOD OF TIME FOR INSURERS TO REMEDY ANY
15	UNFAIRLY DISCRIMINATORY IMPACT IN AN ALGORITHM OR PREDICTIVE
16	MODEL; AND
17	(II) The ability of insurers to use external consumer data
18	AND INFORMATION SOURCES, AS WELL AS ALGORITHMS OR PREDICTIVE
19	MODELS USING EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES,
20	THAT HAVE BEEN PREVIOUSLY ASSESSED BY THE DIVISION AND FOUND NOT
21	TO BE UNFAIRLY DISCRIMINATORY.
22	(d) DOCUMENTS, MATERIALS, AND OTHER INFORMATION IN THE
23	POSSESSION OR CONTROL OF THE DIVISION THAT ARE OBTAINED BY,
24	CREATED BY, OR DISCLOSED TO THE COMMISSIONER OR ANY OTHER
25	PERSON PURSUANT TO THIS SECTION OR ANY RULES ADOPTED PURSUANT
26	TO THIS SECTION ARE RECOGNIZED AS PROPRIETARY AND CONTAINING
27	TRADE SECRETS. ALL SUCH DOCUMENTS, MATERIALS, AND OTHER

1 INFORMATION ARE CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED; ARE NOT SUBJECT TO 2 DISCLOSURE UNDER THE "COLORADO OPEN RECORDS ACT", PART 2 OF 3 ARTICLE 72 OF TITLE 24, OR OTHER OPEN RECORDS, FREEDOM OF 4 INFORMATION, SUNSHINE, OR SIMILAR LAW OF THIS STATE; ARE NOT 5 SUBJECT TO SUBPOENA; AND ARE NOT SUBJECT TO DISCOVERY OR 6 ADMISSIBLE IN EVIDENCE IN ANY PRIVATE CIVIL ACTION. HOWEVER, THE 7 COMMISSIONER MAY USE THE DOCUMENTS, MATERIALS, OR OTHER 8 INFORMATION IN THE FURTHERANCE OF ANY REGULATORY OR LEGAL 9 ACTION BROUGHT AS PART OF THE COMMISSIONER'S OFFICIAL DUTIES. THE 10 COMMISSIONER SHALL NOT OTHERWISE MAKE THE DOCUMENTS, 11 MATERIALS, OR OTHER INFORMATION PUBLIC WITHOUT THE PRIOR WRITTEN 12 CONSENT OF THE INSURER FROM WHICH THE DOCUMENTS, MATERIALS, OR 13 OTHER INFORMATION WAS OBTAINED. THE COMMISSIONER MAY MAKE 14 DATA PUBLICLY AVAILABLE IN AN AGGREGATED OR DE-IDENTIFIED 15 FORMAT IN A MANNER DEEMED APPROPRIATE BY THE COMMISSIONER.

(4) PURSUANT TO SECTION 10-3-1106, THE COMMISSIONER MAY
EXAMINE AND INVESTIGATE AN INSURER'S USE OF AN EXTERNAL
CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCE, ALGORITHM, OR PREDICTIVE
MODEL IN ANY INSURANCE PRACTICE. INSURERS SHALL COOPERATE WITH
THE COMMISSIONER AND THE DIVISION IN ANY EXAMINATION OR
INVESTIGATION UNDER THIS SECTION.

(5) (a) IN THE REPORT SUBMITTED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF
REGULATORY AGENCIES TO THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEES OF REFERENCE
DURING THE FIRST TWO WEEKS OF EACH REGULAR LEGISLATIVE SESSION,
PURSUANT TO PART 2 OF ARTICLE 7 OF TITLE 2, THE DIVISION SHALL
INCLUDE:

27 (I) INFORMATION CONCERNING ANY RULES ADOPTED PURSUANT TO

-7-

1 THIS SECTION;

2	(II) INFORMATION CONCERNING ANY CHANGES IN INSURANCE
3	RATES THAT HAVE RESULTED FROM THE PROHIBITIONS DESCRIBED IN
4	SUBSECTION $(1)$ OF THIS SECTION;
5	(III) A SUMMARY OF THE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PROCESS
6	DESCRIBED IN SUBSECTION (2)(b) OF THIS SECTION; AND
7	(IV) A DESCRIPTION OF DATA SOURCES, IF ANY, DISCUSSED DURING
8	THE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PROCESS, WHICH DATA SOURCES
9	INSURERS MAY USE TO COMPLY WITH THIS SECTION.
10	(b) This subsection (5) is repealed, effective July 1, 2025.
11	(6) NOTWITHSTANDING ANY PROVISION OF THIS SECTION TO THE
12	CONTRARY, THIS SECTION DOES NOT APPLY TO:
13	(a) TITLE INSURANCE, AS DEFINED IN SECTION 10-11-102 (8);
14	(b) BONDS EXECUTED BY QUALIFIED SURETY COMPANIES
15	PURSUANT TO PART $3$ of article $4$ of this title $10$ ; or
16	(c) INSURERS ISSUING COMMERCIAL INSURANCE POLICIES; EXCEPT
17	THAT THIS SECTION DOES APPLY TO INSURERS THAT ISSUE BUSINESS
18	OWNERS' POLICIES OR COMMERCIAL GENERAL LIABILITY POLICIES, WHICH
19	BUSINESS OWNERS' POLICIES OR COMMERCIAL GENERAL LIABILITY POLICIES
20	HAVE ANNUAL PREMIUMS OF TEN THOUSAND DOLLARS OR LESS.
21	(7) NOTHING IN THIS SECTION:
22	(a) REQUIRES AN INSURER TO COLLECT FROM AN APPLICANT OR
23	POLICYHOLDER THE RACE, COLOR, NATIONAL OR ETHNIC ORIGIN, RELIGION,
24	SEX, SEXUAL ORIENTATION, DISABILITY, GENDER IDENTITY, OR GENDER
25	EXPRESSION OF AN INDIVIDUAL; OR
26	(b) MAY BE CONSTRUED TO:
27	(I) PROHIBIT THE USE OF, OR REQUIRE LIFE, ANNUITY, LONG-TERM

1 CARE, OR DISABILITY INSURERS TO TEST, MEDICAL, FAMILY HISTORY, 2 OCCUPATIONAL, DISABILITY, OR BEHAVIORAL INFORMATION RELATED TO 3 A SPECIFIC INDIVIDUAL, WHICH INFORMATION, BASED ON ACTUARIALLY SOUND PRINCIPLES, HAS A DIRECT RELATIONSHIP TO MORTALITY, 4 5 MORBIDITY, OR LONGEVITY RISK UNLESS SUCH INFORMATION IS 6 OTHERWISE INCLUDED IN THE TESTING OF AN ALGORITHM OR PREDICTIVE 7 MODEL THAT ALSO USES EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION 8 SOURCES:

9 (II) PROHIBIT THE USE OF, OR REQUIRE LIFE, ANNUITY, LONG-TERM 10 CARE, OR DISABILITY INSURERS TO TEST, TRADITIONAL UNDERWRITING 11 FACTORS BEING USED FOR THE EXCLUSIVE PURPOSE OF DETERMINING 12 INSURABLE INTEREST OR ELIGIBILITY FOR COVERAGE UNLESS SUCH 13 FACTORS ARE OTHERWISE INCLUDED IN THE TESTING OF AN ALGORITHM OR 14 PREDICTIVE MODEL THAT ALSO USES EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND 15 INFORMATION SOURCES;

16 (III) AMEND, MODIFY, OR SUPERSEDE SECTION 10-3-1104
17 (1)(f)(III) OR (1)(f)(IV); OR

(IV) PROHIBIT THE USE OF OR REQUIRE THE TESTING OF
LONGSTANDING AND WELL-ESTABLISHED COMMON INDUSTRY PRACTICES
IN SETTLING CLAIMS OR TRADITIONAL UNDERWRITING PRACTICES UNLESS
SUCH PRACTICES OR FACTORS ARE OTHERWISE INCLUDED IN THE TESTING
OF AN ALGORITHM OR PREDICTIVE MODEL THAT ALSO USES EXTERNAL
CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES.

24 (8) AS USED IN THIS SECTION, UNLESS THE CONTEXT OTHERWISE
25 REQUIRES:

26 (a) "Algorithm" means a computational or machine
27 LEARNING PROCESS THAT INFORMS HUMAN DECISION MAKING IN

-9-

1 INSURANCE PRACTICES.

2	(b) (I) "EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCE"
3	MEANS A DATA OR AN INFORMATION SOURCE THAT IS USED BY AN INSURER
4	TO SUPPLEMENT TRADITIONAL UNDERWRITING OR OTHER INSURANCE
5	PRACTICES OR TO ESTABLISH LIFESTYLE INDICATORS THAT ARE USED IN
6	INSURANCE PRACTICES. "EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION
7	SOURCE" INCLUDES CREDIT SCORES, SOCIAL MEDIA HABITS, LOCATIONS,
8	PURCHASING HABITS, HOME OWNERSHIP, EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT,
9	OCCUPATION, LICENSURES, CIVIL JUDGMENTS, AND COURT RECORDS.
10	(II) THE COMMISSIONER MAY PROMULGATE RULES TO FURTHER
11	DEFINE "EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCE" FOR
12	PARTICULAR LINES OF INSURANCE AND INSURANCE PRACTICES.
13	(c) "INSURANCE PRACTICE" MEANS MARKETING, UNDERWRITING,
14	PRICING, UTILIZATION MANAGEMENT, REIMBURSEMENT METHODOLOGIES,
15	AND CLAIMS MANAGEMENT IN THE TRANSACTION OF INSURANCE.
16	(d) "PREDICTIVE MODEL" MEANS A PROCESS OF USING
17	MATHEMATICAL AND COMPUTATIONAL METHODS THAT EXAMINE CURRENT
18	AND HISTORICAL DATA SETS FOR UNDERLYING PATTERNS AND CALCULATE
19	THE PROBABILITY OF AN OUTCOME.
20	(e) "UNFAIRLY DISCRIMINATE" AND "UNFAIR DISCRIMINATION"
21	INCLUDE THE USE OF ONE OR MORE EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND
22	INFORMATION SOURCES, AS WELL AS ALGORITHMS OR PREDICTIVE MODELS
23	USING EXTERNAL CONSUMER DATA AND INFORMATION SOURCES, THAT
24	HAVE A CORRELATION TO RACE, COLOR, NATIONAL OR ETHNIC ORIGIN,
25	RELIGION, SEX, SEXUAL ORIENTATION, DISABILITY, GENDER IDENTITY, OR
26	GENDER EXPRESSION, AND THAT USE RESULTS IN A DISPROPORTIONATELY
27	NEGATIVE OUTCOME FOR SUCH CLASSIFICATION OR CLASSIFICATIONS,

<ul><li>2 THE UNDERLYING INSURANCE PRACTICE, INCLUDING LOSSES AND COSTS</li><li>3 FOR UNDERWRITING.</li></ul>	1	WHICH NEGATIVE OUTCOME EXCEEDS THE REASONABLE CORRELATION TO
	2	THE UNDERLYING INSURANCE PRACTICE, INCLUDING LOSSES AND COSTS

4 SECTION 3. Act subject to petition - effective date. This act 5 takes effect at 12:01 a.m. on the day following the expiration of the 6 ninety-day period after final adjournment of the general assembly; except 7 that, if a referendum petition is filed pursuant to section 1 (3) of article V 8 of the state constitution against this act or an item, section, or part of this 9 act within such period, then the act, item, section, or part will not take effect unless approved by the people at the general election to be held in 10 11 November 2022 and, in such case, will take effect on the date of the official declaration of the vote thereon by the governor. 12