First Regular Session Seventy-fourth General Assembly STATE OF COLORADO

REVISED

This Version Includes All Amendments Adopted on Second Reading in the Second House

LLS NO. R23-0150.01 Conrad Imel x2313

HCR23-1001

HOUSE SPONSORSHIP

Weissman and Lynch, Bacon, Amabile, Bird, Boesenecker, Brown, Catlin, deGruy Kennedy, Epps, Frizell, Froelich, Gonzales-Gutierrez, Hamrick, Jodeh, Joseph, Kipp, Lieder, Lindsay, Marshall, McCluskie, Ricks, Sirota, Snyder, Soper, Story, Titone, Young

SENATE SPONSORSHIP

Gardner and Gonzales, Moreno, Van Winkle

House Committees

Judiciary Appropriations

Senate Committees

Judiciary Appropriations

HOUSE CONCURRENT RESOLUTION 23-1001 SUBMITTING TO THE REGISTERED ELECTORS OF THE STATE OF COLORADO AN AMENDMENT TO THE COLORADO CONSTITUTION CONCERNING JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE, AND, IN CONNECTION THEREWITH, ESTABLISHING AN INDEPENDENT JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD, SETTING STANDARDS FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW OF A DISCIPLINE CASE, AND CLARIFYING WHEN DISCIPLINE PROCEEDINGS BECOME PUBLIC.

Resolution Summary

(Note: This summary applies to this resolution as introduced and does not reflect any amendments that may be subsequently adopted. If this resolution passes third reading in the house of introduction, a resolution summary that applies to the reengrossed version of this resolution will be available at http://leg.colorado.gov/.)

SENATE Amended 2nd Reading April 28, 2023

> HOUSE rd Reading Unamended April 6, 2023

HOUSE Amended 2nd Reading April 5, 2023

Shading denotes HOUSE amendment. <u>Double underlining denotes SENATE amendment.</u>

Capital letters or bold & italic numbers indicate new material to be added to existing law.

Dashes through the words or numbers indicate deletions from existing law.

Legislative Interim Committee on Judicial Discipline. The concurrent resolution amends section 23 of article VI of the Colorado constitution as it relates to judicial discipline. Under existing law, the commission on judicial discipline (commission) investigates complaints of judicial misconduct; conducts formal judicial disciplinary proceedings; and may dismiss complaints, impose informal sanctions, or recommend that the Colorado supreme court impose formal sanctions. The commission may also request that the supreme court appoint special masters to hear and take evidence on a matter and report to the commission.

The resolution clarifies the commission's authority to dismiss complaints. The resolution repeals the authority of the commission to conduct formal judicial disciplinary proceedings and request appointment of special masters, and creates an independent adjudicative board (board) to conduct formal proceedings and hear appeals of the commission's orders imposing informal sanctions. The board is comprised of 4 district court judges, 4 attorneys, and 4 citizens. The resolution prohibits a member of the commission from being appointed to the board and prohibits a member of the board from being appointed to the commission. A randomly selected panel of the board, comprised of one judge, one attorney, and one citizen, conducts formal proceedings in a case. The resolution permits the panel to dismiss a complaint, impose informal sanctions, or impose formal sanctions.

The resolution sets the standards of review to be used by the supreme court when it reviews a panel's decision. The resolution requires a tribunal of 7 randomly selected court of appeals judges to review the panel's decision in the same manner and using the same standards of review when: The proceedings involve a complaint against a Colorado supreme court justice; a Colorado supreme court justice, a staff member to a justice, or a family member of a justice is a complainant or a material witness in the proceeding; or more than 2 justices have recused themselves from the proceeding. The tribunal reviews the panel's decision in the same manner and using the same standards of review as the supreme court does when it reviews panel decisions.

Under existing law, commission proceedings are confidential until the commission files recommendations with the supreme court. The resolution makes proceedings public at the commencement of formal proceedings and clarifies that appeals to the board of informal remedial sanctions are confidential. The resolution clarifies that a person is absolutely immune from any action for defamation based on papers filed with or testimony before the commission, adjudicative board, supreme court, or tribunal. The resolution clarifies the circumstances in which the commission may release otherwise confidential information.

The resolution creates a rule-making committee to propose rules

-2- 1001

for the commission. The supreme court approves or rejects each rule proposed by the rule-making committee. The Colorado rules of evidence and Colorado rules of civil procedure, as amended, apply to proceedings before a panel of the adjudicative board until and unless the supreme court promulgates rules specifically governing panel proceedings.

1 Be It Resolved by the House of Representatives of the 2 Seventy-fourth General Assembly of the State of Colorado, the Senate 3 concurring herein: 4 **SECTION 1.** At the election held on November 5, 2024, the 5 secretary of state shall submit to the registered electors of the state the 6 ballot title set forth in section 2 for the following amendment to the state 7 constitution: 8 In the constitution of the state of Colorado, section 23 of article 9 VI, **amend** (3)(a), (3)(e), (3)(f), (3)(g), and (3)(h); and **add** (3)(c.5) and 10 (3)(k) as follows: Section 23. Retirement and removal of justices and judges. 11 12 (3) (a) There shall be a commission on judicial discipline. It shall consist 13 of: Two judges of district courts and two judges of county courts, each 14 selected by the supreme court; THE ACTIVE DISTRICT JUDGES AND COUNTY 15 COURT JUDGES OF THE STATE, AS PROVIDED IN LAW; two citizens admitted 16 to practice law in the courts of this state, neither of whom shall be a 17 justice or judge, who shall have practiced in this state for at least ten years 18 and who shall be appointed by the governor, with the consent of the 19 senate; and four citizens, none of whom shall be a justice or judge, active 20 or retired, nor admitted to practice law in the courts of this state, who 21 shall be appointed by the governor, with the consent of the senate. AN 22 APPOINTING AUTHORITY SHALL NOT APPOINT A MEMBER OF THE 23 INDEPENDENT JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD ESTABLISHED IN

-3-

SUBSECTION (3)(c.5) OF THIS SECTION TO THE COMMISSION.

1

27

(II)

2 (c.5) (I) THERE IS CREATED THE INDEPENDENT JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE 3 ADJUDICATIVE BOARD AS AN INDEPENDENT AGENCY WITHIN THE JUDICIAL 4 DEPARTMENT. THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD SHALL CONDUCT FORMAL 5 JUDICIAL DISCIPLINARY PROCEEDINGS. THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD ALSO 6 SHALL HEAR APPEALS OF THE COMMISSION'S ORDERS OF INFORMAL 7 REMEDIAL ACTION. APPEALS TO THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD ARE 8 CONFIDENTIAL. THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD CONSISTS OF FOUR DISTRICT 9 COURT JUDGES WITHOUT ANY JUDICIAL OR ATTORNEY DISCIPLINARY 10 HISTORY, APPOINTED BY THE SUPREME COURT; FOUR ATTORNEYS WITHOUT 11 ANY JUDICIAL OR ATTORNEY DISCIPLINARY HISTORY WHO ARE LICENSED 12 TO PRACTICE LAW IN COLORADO AND WHO RESIDE IN COLORADO, 13 APPOINTED BY THE GOVERNOR AND CONFIRMED BY THE SENATE; AND 14 FOUR CITIZENS WHO ARE NOT JUDGES OR ATTORNEYS LICENSED TO 15 PRACTICE LAW IN COLORADO, APPOINTED BY THE GOVERNOR AND 16 CONFIRMED BY THE SENATE. AN APPOINTING AUTHORITY SHALL NOT 17 APPOINT A MEMBER OF THE COMMISSION TO THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD. 18 FOR THE PURPOSE OF STAGGERING TERMS, WHEN MAKING THE INITIAL 19 APPOINTMENTS TO THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD, THE APPOINTING 20 AUTHORITY SHALL DESIGNATE TWO MEMBERS FROM EACH CATEGORY TO 21 A FIVE-YEAR TERM AND TWO MEMBERS FROM EACH CATEGORY TO A 22 THREE-YEAR TERM. ALL SUBSEQUENT APPOINTMENTS ARE FOR A TERM OF 23 FIVE YEARS; EXCEPT THAT IN THE EVENT OF A VACANCY ON THE 24 ADJUDICATIVE BOARD, THE ORIGINAL APPOINTING AUTHORITY SHALL 25 APPOINT, IN THE SAME MANNER AS AN ORIGINAL APPOINTMENT, A 26 REPLACEMENT TO SERVE THE REMAINDER OF THE TERM.

-4- 1001

UPON ORDER OF A FORMAL HEARING PURSUANT TO

SUBSECTION (3)(e) OF THIS SECTION, A PANEL OF THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD SHALL CONVENE TO CONDUCT THE HEARING. A PANEL CONSISTS OF ONE JUDGE, ONE ATTORNEY LICENSED TO PRACTICE LAW IN COLORADO, AND ONE CITIZEN. THE STATE COURT ADMINISTRATOR, OR THE ADMINISTRATOR'S DESIGNEE, SHALL RANDOMLY SELECT THE PANEL FROM AMONG THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD'S MEMBERSHIP. THE RANDOM SELECTION OF A PANEL IS A PURELY ADMINISTRATIVE FUNCTION.

(e) (I) The commission may, after such investigation as it deems necessary, DISMISS A COMPLAINT, order informal remedial action, OR order a formal hearing to be held before it A PANEL OF THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD concerning the removal, retirement, suspension, censure, reprimand, or other discipline of a justice or a judge. or request the supreme court to appoint three special masters, who shall be justices or judges of courts of record, to hear and take evidence in any such matter and to report thereon to the commission. The RESPONDENT JUSTICE OR JUDGE MAY APPEAL THE COMMISSION'S ORDER FOR INFORMAL REMEDIAL ACTION TO A PANEL OF THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD. THE ADJUDICATIVE PANEL SHALL REVIEW THE COMMISSION'S INFORMAL REMEDIAL ACTION ORDER FOR ABUSE OF DISCRETION. AN APPEAL OF AN INFORMAL REMEDIAL ACTION ORDER IS CONFIDENTIAL CONSISTENT WITH SUBSECTION (3)(g) OF THIS SECTION.

(II) After a formal hearing, or after considering the record and report of the masters, if the commission finds good cause therefor, it THE ADJUDICATIVE PANEL may DISMISS THE CHARGES BEFORE IT; take informal remedial action; or it may recommend to the supreme court ORDER the removal, retirement, suspension, censure, reprimand, or OTHER discipline, as the case may be, of the justice or judge. The commission

-5-

1 ADJUDICATIVE PANEL may also recommend ORDER that the costs of its

2 THE investigation and hearing be assessed against such justice or judge.

THE JUSTICE OR JUDGE MAY APPEAL AN ADJUDICATIVE PANEL'S

4 DISCIPLINARY ORDER, AND THE COMMISSION MAY APPEAL AN

5 ADJUDICATIVE PANEL'S DISMISSAL OR DISCIPLINARY ORDER, TO THE

6 SUPREME COURT OR, WHEN THE CIRCUMSTANCES DESCRIBED IN

SUBSECTION (3)(f)(II) OF THIS SECTION ARE PRESENT, TO THE TRIBUNAL

8 DESCRIBED IN SUBSECTION (3)(f)(II) OF THIS SECTION.

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Following receipt of a recommendation from the commission, the supreme court shall review the record of the proceedings on the law and facts and in its discretion may permit the introduction of additional evidence and shall order ON APPEAL OF AN ADJUDICATIVE PANEL'S ORDER FOR removal, retirement, suspension, censure, reprimand, or OTHER discipline, as it finds just and proper, or wholly reject the recommendation OR A PANEL'S DISMISSAL OF CHARGES, THE SUPREME COURT, OR THE TRIBUNAL DESCRIBED IN SUBSECTION (3)(f)(II) OF THIS SECTION IF THE TRIBUNAL IS HEARING THE APPEAL, SHALL REVIEW THE RECORD OF THE PROCEEDINGS ON THE LAW AND FACTS. WHEN REVIEWING THE ADJUDICATIVE PANEL'S DECISION, THE SUPREME COURT SHALL REVIEW MATTERS OF LAW DE NOVO, REVIEW FACTUAL MATTERS TO DETERMINE WHETHER THE ADJUDICATIVE PANEL'S DETERMINATION IS CLEARLY ERRONEOUS, AND REVIEW ANY SANCTIONS IMPOSED BY THE ADJUDICATIVE PANEL FOR ABUSE OF DISCRETION. Upon an order for retirement, the justice or judge shall thereby be retired with the same rights and privileges as if he retired pursuant to statute. Upon an order for removal, the justice or judge shall thereby be removed from office, and his salary shall cease from the date of such order. On the entry of an order for

-6- 1001

matimamamt am										
Tetilement of	TOI TEIMOVA	i oi a	Tuu	ige, in	15 011	ICC S	пап	υc	accinca	vacani.

1

24

25

26

2	(11) IN PROCEEDINGS IN WHICH THE CIRCUMSTANCES DESCRIBED IN
3	THIS SUBSECTION (3)(f)(II) ARE PRESENT, A TRIBUNAL COMPRISED OF
4	SEVEN JUDGES OF THE COURT OF APPEALS AND DISTRICT COURT SHALL
5	REVIEW THE DECISION OF THE ADJUDICATIVE PANEL OR HEAR ANY OTHER
6	APPEAL IN THE SAME MANNER AND USE THE SAME STANDARDS OF REVIEW
7	AS THE SUPREME COURT WHEN IT REVIEWS DECISIONS AND HEARS APPEALS
8	AS DESCRIBED IN SUBSECTION $(3)(f)(I)$ OF THIS SECTION. THE STATE
9	COURT ADMINISTRATOR, OR THE ADMINISTRATOR'S DESIGNEE, SHALL
10	RANDOMLY SELECT MEMBERS OF THE TRIBUNAL FROM AMONG ALL
11	DISTRICT JUDGES AND COURT OF APPEALS JUDGES WHO DO NOT HAVE A
12	CURRENT DISCIPLINARY INVESTIGATION OR PROCEEDING PENDING BEFORE
13	THE COMMISSION OR ADJUDICATIVE BOARD; HAVE NOT RECEIVED A
14	DISCIPLINARY SANCTION FROM THE COMMISSION, ADJUDICATIVE BOARD,
15	OR SUPREME COURT; AND ARE NOT OTHERWISE REQUIRED BY LAW, COURT
16	RULE, OR JUDICIAL CANON TO RECUSE THEMSELVES FROM THE TRIBUNAL.
17	A TRIBUNAL MUST NOT INCLUDE MORE THAN ONE MEMBER WHO IS A
18	COURT OF APPEALS JUDGE AND NOT MORE THAN ONE DISTRICT JUDGE
19	FROM ANY ONE JUDICIAL DISTRICT. THE RANDOM SELECTION OF TRIBUNAL
20	MEMBERS IS A PURELY ADMINISTRATIVE FUNCTION. THE TRIBUNAL SHALL
21	REVIEW DECISIONS AND HEAR ANY OTHER APPEALS IN THE FOLLOWING
22	CIRCUMSTANCES:
23	(A) WHEN THE PROCEEDINGS INVOLVE A COMPLAINT AGAINST A

- (A) WHEN THE PROCEEDINGS INVOLVE A COMPLAINT AGAINST A COLORADO SUPREME COURT JUSTICE;
- (B) WHEN A COLORADO SUPREME COURT JUSTICE IS A COMPLAINANT OR A MATERIAL WITNESS IN THE PROCEEDING;
- 27 (C) When a staff member to a Colorado supreme court

-7- 1001

JUSTICE IS A COMPLAINANT OR MATERIAL WITNESS IN THE PROCEEDING;

- (D) WHEN A FAMILY MEMBER OF A COLORADO SUPREME COURT
 JUSTICE IS A COMPLAINANT OR MATERIAL WITNESS IN THE PROCEEDING; OR
- 4 (E) WHEN ANY OTHER CIRCUMSTANCES EXIST DUE TO WHICH
 5 MORE THAN TWO COLORADO SUPREME COURT JUSTICES HAVE RECUSED
 6 THEMSELVES FROM THE PROCEEDING.
 - (III) UPON A DETERMINATION THAT A SANCTION IMPOSED BY THE ADJUDICATIVE PANEL IS AN ABUSE OF DISCRETION, THE SUPREME COURT OR, IF APPLICABLE, THE TRIBUNAL, SHALL REMAND THE PROCEEDINGS TO THE PANEL THAT IMPOSED THE SANCTION WITH DIRECTIONS THE COURT OR TRIBUNAL DEEMS NECESSARY.
 - (IV) Upon an order for retirement, the justice or judge is retired with the same rights and privileges as if the justice or judge retired pursuant to statute. Upon an order for removal, the justice or judge is removed from office and the justice's or judge's salary ceases from the date of the order. On the entry of an order for retirement or for removal of a justice or judge, the justice's or judge's office is deemed vacant.
 - (g) (I) Prior to the filing of a recommendation to the supreme court by the commission COMMENCEMENT OF FORMAL DISCIPLINARY PROCEEDINGS against any justice or judge, all papers filed with and proceedings before the commission on judicial discipline or masters appointed by the supreme court, pursuant to this subsection (3), shall be ARE confidential, and the filing of papers with and the giving of testimony before the commission or the masters shall be privileged; but no other publication of such papers or proceedings shall be privileged in any action for defamation; except that the record filed by the commission in

-8-

- the supreme court continues privileged IS CONFIDENTIAL. A PERSON IS ABSOLUTELY IMMUNE FROM ANY ACTION FOR DEFAMATION BASED ON PAPERS FILED WITH OR TESTIMONY BEFORE THE COMMISSION, THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD, THE SUPREME COURT, OR THE TRIBUNAL, BUT NO OTHER PUBLICATION OF THE PAPERS OR PROCEEDINGS HAS ABSOLUTE IMMUNITY IN ANY ACTION FOR DEFAMATION and a writing which THAT was privileged prior to its filing with the commission or the masters does not lose such privilege by such filing.
- 9 (II) NOTWITHSTANDING THE CONFIDENTIALITY REQUIREMENT 10 DESCRIBED IN THIS SUBSECTION (3)(g), THE COMMISSION MAY:

- (A) RELEASE INFORMATION ABOUT THE STATUS OF AN EVALUATION, INVESTIGATION, OR PROCEEDING TO THE VICTIM OF MISCONDUCT OR THE COMPLAINANT;
- (B) RELEASE INFORMATION ABOUT A COMPLAINT THAT RESULTED IN INFORMAL REMEDIAL ACTION OR PUBLIC DISCIPLINE OF A JUDGE OR JUSTICE TO THE STATE COURT ADMINISTRATOR AS NECESSARY FOR THE SELECTION OF A TRIBUNAL PURSUANT TO SUBSECTION (3)(f)(II) OF THIS SECTION; ANY RELEVANT COMMISSION ON JUDICIAL PERFORMANCE OR JUDICIAL NOMINATING COMMISSION, THE OFFICE OF ATTORNEY REGULATION COUNSEL, AND THE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDING DISCIPLINARY JUDGE, OR SUCCESSORS TO EACH COMMISSION OR OFFICE; THE OFFICE OF THE GOVERNOR, FOR THE PURPOSE OF JUDICIAL APPOINTMENTS; THE JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT, FOR THE PURPOSE OF REVIEWING APPLICANTS FOR THE SENIOR JUDGE PROGRAM AND APPOINTMENTS TO THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD PURSUANT TO SUBSECTION (3)(c.5)(I) OF THIS SECTION; AND OTHER LIMITED RECIPIENTS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSES OF THIS SECTION ALLOWED BY RULE; AND

-9- 1001

1	(C) MAKE PUBLICLY AVAILABLE AGGREGATE INFORMATION ABOUT
2	TRENDS OR PATTERNS IN COMPLAINTS MADE TO THE COMMISSION, BUT THE
3	COMMISSION SHALL NOT MAKE PUBLIC ANY INFORMATION THAT IDENTIFIES
4	ANY SPECIFIC PERSON OR COMPLAINT.
5	(III) A RECIPIENT OF CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION PURSUANT TO
6	SUBSECTION $(3)(g)(II)(B)$ of this section shall preserve the
7	CONFIDENTIALITY OF THE INFORMATION SUBJECT TO ANY SANCTIONS FOR
8	VIOLATION OF CONFIDENTIALITY AS MAY BE PROVIDED BY LAW.
9	(IV) THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY MAY PROVIDE BY LAW FOR
10	CONFIDENTIAL REPORTING AND COMPLAINANT RIGHTS CONSISTENT WITH
11	SUBSECTION $(3)(g)(II)$ OF THIS SECTION.
12	(h) The supreme court shall by rule provide for procedures before
13	the commission on judicial discipline, the masters, and the supreme court.
14	The rules shall also provide the standards and degree of proof to be
15	applied by the commission in its proceedings. A justice or judge who is
16	a member of the commission COMMISSION, ADJUDICATIVE BOARD,
17	TRIBUNAL, or supreme court shall not participate in any proceedings
18	involving his the Justice's or Judge's own removal or retirement.
19	(k) (I) THERE IS CREATED A RULE-MAKING COMMITTEE TO ADOPT
20	RULES FOR THE JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE PROCESS. THE RULE-MAKING
21	COMMITTEE CONSISTS OF THREE MEMBERS APPOINTED BY THE SUPREME
22	COURT, THREE MEMBERS APPOINTED BY THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD,
23	THREE MEMBERS APPOINTED BY THE COMMISSION, THREE ATTORNEYS WHO
24	HAVE EXPERIENCE AS RESPONDENT COUNSEL IN JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE
25	PROCEEDINGS APPOINTED BY THE GOVERNOR, AND ONE REPRESENTATIVE
26	OF A VICTIMS' RIGHTS ORGANIZATION APPOINTED BY THE GOVERNOR.
27	MEMBERS SERVE AT THE PLEASURE OF THEIR APPOINTING AUTHORITY.

-10-

1	I HE RULE-MAKING COMMITTEE SHALL ELECT A CHAIR WHO IS A MEMBER
2	OF THE COMMITTEE. THE RULES MUST INCLUDE THE STANDARDS AND
3	DEGREE OF PROOF TO BE APPLIED IN JUDICIAL DISCIPLINE PROCEEDINGS;
4	CONFIDENTIAL REPORTING PROCEDURES; AND COMPLAINANT RIGHTS
5	DURING THE EVALUATION, INVESTIGATION, AND HEARING PROCESS. THE
6	GENERAL ASSEMBLY MAY PROVIDE BY LAW FOR CONFIDENTIAL REPORTING
7	AND COMPLAINANT RIGHTS.
8	(II) THE RULE-MAKING COMMITTEE MAY PROMULGATE SPECIFIC
9	RULES GOVERNING PROCEEDINGS BEFORE A PANEL OF THE ADJUDICATIVE
10	BOARD. THE COLORADO RULES OF EVIDENCE AND COLORADO RULES OF
11	CIVIL PROCEDURE, AS AMENDED, APPLY TO PROCEEDINGS BEFORE A PANEL
12	OF THE ADJUDICATIVE BOARD UNTIL AND UNLESS THE RULE-MAKING
13	COMMITTEE PROMULGATES RULES GOVERNING PANEL PROCEEDINGS.
14	Rules promulgated pursuant to this subsection $(3)(k)(II)$ apply to
15	FORMAL PROCEEDINGS INITIATED ON OR AFTER APRIL 1, 2025.
16	SECTION 2. Each elector voting at the election may cast a vote
17	either "Yes/For" or "No/Against" on the following ballot title: "Shall
18	there be an amendment to the Colorado constitution concerning judicial
19	discipline, and, in connection therewith, establishing an independent
20	judicial discipline adjudicative board, setting standards for judicial review
21	of a discipline case, and clarifying when discipline proceedings become
22	public?"
23	SECTION 3. Except as otherwise provided in section 1-40-123,
24	Colorado Revised Statutes, if at least fifty-five percent of the electors
25	voting on the ballot title vote "Yes/For", then the amendment will become
26	part of the state constitution.

-11- 1001